

The Ts'an-k'ao Hsiao-hsi: How Well Informed are Chinese Officials about the Outside World?

By HENRY G. SCHWARZ*

IN the continuing debate on whether to establish normal diplomatic relations with the government in Peking, those who favour such a step invariably assert that recognition would, besides other alleged advantages, reduce the risks of a war born of mutual ignorance. A clear presentation of this view is found in the recent Quaker proposals for a *A New China Policy*: "American public ignorance of contemporary China and Chinese ignorance of us are among the chief reasons for the tension and hostility between us. This is dangerous in itself, and it threatens the peace of the world."¹

This is an important argument which deserves careful consideration. The Chinese Communist Press has presented news and features about the outside world in a manner which most literate people in the world would consider a distortion of reality. The principal national newspapers, such as *Jen-min Jih-pao* (*People's Daily*), *Kuang-ming Jih-pao*, *Ta Kung Pao*, *Chung-kuo Ch'ing-nien Pao* and *Kung-jen Pao*, as well as Party journals such as *Hung Ch'i* (*Red Flag*), have presented not "all the news fit to print" but rather all the news (and "non-news") and comment that happens to support in some way the current line of the Peking leadership. As a result, for the past seventeen years, hundreds of millions of Chinese have been told with remarkable consistency that America is Evil incarnate, aggressive and decadent at the same time. It is, therefore, understandable that besides wounding the American national ego, this kind of "news coverage" has also generated a widespread concern in the United States that pervasive and persistent distortion will in time lead to miscalculation and, possibly, war.

But such argument rests on two assumptions: (1) that Communist China has less access to world communications channels than other countries have; and (2) that all persons in Communist China are

* This article is an abridgement of an even more detailed study prepared by the author.

¹ American Friends Service Committee, *A New China Policy: Some Quaker Proposals* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1965), p. 27.

subject to the same meagre diet of distorted news dispensed by the mass publications.

The first assumption is false. Communist China quite naturally has complete access to all major international communications channels. Reuters, AFP and TASS have offices in Peking where services are reciprocated with *Hsin Hua Tung-hsün* or *New China News Agency* (hereafter NCNA). Associated Press is subscribed to in Hong Kong.² Moreover, NCNA monitors over forty stations of thirty foreign news services, totalling about 300,000 words and 281 hours daily in radio-teletype, Hellschreiber and morse code.³ The real question, then, is not whether Communist China is lacking information but what she does with the vast amount of information at her disposal.

This question leads to the second assumption which is unrealistic. For years, Western observers have felt that the leadership which is the sole determinant of state policy in mainland China is given wider access to information about the outside world than are the people. In the Soviet Union, TASS distributes two special series of news among the political leadership, one restricted to the highest echelons and the other more widely distributed. They differ in scope and objectivity, and both, in turn, contain substantially more objective news than the mass publications.⁴

For years, students of Communist China have been tantalised by rumours of similar Chinese publications of limited circulation, but hard evidence has been very difficult to come by. The first major break occurred when the American Government released some issues of the so-called *Secret Military Papers*, or *Bulletin of Activities of the General Political Department of the People's Liberation Army*.⁵ This periodical was restricted in its circulation to commanders and political commissars at the regimental level and above. Primarily concerned

² This statement is based on information given by former and present employees whom I consider reliable. They report that since the late 1940s, AP has served one or more Communist papers in Hong Kong and that at present (March 1966), four Communist papers in Hong Kong subscribe to AP. The AP news service transmitted to these Communist Chinese newspapers and all other AP subscribers in Asia consists of more than 50,000 words daily. It contains general news, local Pacific news, sports, business news and features. Likewise, AP's radiophoto and airmailed newsphoto services are available to these Communist newspapers. However, A.P. officials flatly deny (as did Henry Hartzbusch, chief of the Tokyo bureau, in a letter to the author dated March 10, 1966) any such dealings with the Chinese Communists.

³ Vincent V. S. King, *A General Study of the Channels of Communication between Communist China and the Western World* (mimeographed), Center for International Studies, M.I.T., 1964, p. 22.

⁴ W. Phillips Davison, *International Political Communication* (New York: Praeger, 1965), p. 99. East European news agencies also have "reference information" bulletins for Party and government officials: see Anthony Buzek, *How the Communist Press Works* (New York: Praeger, 1964), p. 189.

⁵ See *The China Quarterly*, No. 18 (April-June, 1964).

with intra-army affairs, it also dealt with general domestic and, occasionally, international issues. One of the *Bulletin's* most remarkable features was the seemingly objective presentation of facts and the relative absence of the heavy-handed ideological jargon found in publications printed for the people. In other words, the *Bulletin* offered the first hard evidence that at least one segment of the governing élite, higher-ranking officers in the armed forces, was given substantially more accurate information than the people. The *Bulletin* proved beyond reasonable doubt that in the "people's republic" of mainland China, the division between the people and the leadership extends into the field of communications.

This article describes and analyses a restricted circulation newspaper, the *Ts'an-k'ao Hsiao-hsi* (hereafter TKHH), or *Reference Information*. The TKHH is an "internal publication" (*nei-pu k'an-wu*) of NCNA. It is mailed on a subscription basis (said to be 60 cents JMP per month) to Communist Party officials, higher cadres of the Communist Youth League and politically reliable persons in other organisations. The TKHH is only one of several publications restricted to various levels of political leadership. But so far, "internal publications" for top-ranking leaders are not available outside of Communist China. In hotels and guest-houses reserved for Party officials, managers are known to produce upon demand some copies of the TKHH from below the counter. The six issues analysed in this article (February 4, 5, 6, 10, 13 and 21, 1960) were obtained in the vicinity of Peking, and others were seen in several other cities. After a comprehensive investigation, I am satisfied that these issues are genuine and representative in the sense that their acquisition was not subject to any selection criteria. They appear to be the only issues openly available in the United States, and as far as I know the only place outside the United States holding original issues of the TKHH is the Union Research Institute of Hong Kong.⁶

FORMAT

In its technical aspects, the TKHH differs only slightly from publications for the people and hence its appearance is familiar. It contains

⁶ As part of my preliminary work, I inquired about the TKHH from six institutions: the East Asian Institute of Columbia University, the Harvard-Yenching Library, the Hoover Institution, the Library of Congress, the Center of Modern Chinese Studies of the Toyo Bunko and the Union Research Institute. Except for the Union Research Institute which has two issues and the Toyo Bunko which has photocopies of these, the respondents were either unaware of TKHH's existence or they knew of it but had no issues. All American institutions contacted felt that no issues are available in American university libraries. Moreover, one of the foremost authorities on Communist China stated that he "never heard of anyone outside of the mainland having copies."

four pages of the usual format, about 15½ inches by 11 inches, and it is printed on atrociously poor paper (see photo facing p. 54). The date of its first publication is uncertain. In early 1960, it was not published on Mondays nor, apparently, on most official holidays. On the basis of the difference in serial numbers between August 1959 and February 1960, I estimate the date of first publication to be about November 7, 1956. But because of the known irregularity of publication schedules in Communist China, the TKHH may well have first appeared as much as several years earlier. There is also the possibility that the same publication had existed previously under a different title.

The arrangement of items in the TKHH also differs little from that found in mass publications. A typical lay-out is found in the Appendix.⁷ The lay-out is geographical with the front page devoted to events involving Communist or Nationalist China's foreign relations. Page 2 almost always deals with news from other Asian countries; page 3 deals with Europe and the Americas; and page 4 contains feature articles. Features are frequently clustered. For example, half a page might deal with technological innovations in other countries, or developments in Africa or foreign comments on events in China. A standard part of the TKHH is a section containing short items of news monitored from foreign shortwave stations. This section may appear on any page except the front page. Also similar to Chinese and Soviet mass publications is the practice of placing the lead item in the upper left-hand corner of each page. The reader can thus quickly tell which news or feature in any given category is considered most important by the editors.

One of the most striking differences from mass publications is the complete absence of editorials in the TKHH. Explicit guidance, the main function of editorials in mass newspapers, is carried out by headlines and sub-headlines. As the Appendix shows, some headlines are "straight" (e.g., "Mikoyan Arrives in Cuba Today") but most are "guides" (e.g., "Several Indian Papers Initiate Slander and Contention"). Still the amount of explicit guidance possible in the TKHH is necessarily minimal. Another most remarkable aspect of TKHH's content is that the vast majority of news items and feature articles come from foreign sources and are clearly so identified.

In analysing the six issues of TKHH, I will discuss information sources, geographical coverage and coverage of events in four countries: Indonesia, India, Nationalist China and the Soviet Union. The article will conclude with national profiles of the United States and

⁷ Headlines are capitalised; sub-headlines are in lower case. Information within brackets supplied by me. Under each item, source(s), places(s), date(s) and total lineage (on basis of standard 1½ inches width) are listed.

Communist China. At each stage, the TKHH sample will be compared with identically composed samples (*i.e.*, covering the same six dates) of the *People's Daily*⁸ and the *News from Hsinhua News Agency* (hereafter NCNA Bulletin).^{8a} The purpose of this comparison is to underscore the various ways in which news for the leadership differed from that offered to the Chinese people and to the outside world. The analysis will disregard a "science and technology" section on 13, IV,⁹ and all short-news sections. In all subject and profile analyses, TKHH items not related directly to any of the six countries also will be disregarded.

SOURCES

News about other parts of the world presented on the six days under study here to the Chinese people and to foreign audiences was based on relatively few sources. Without exception, all date-lines in both *People's Daily* and the NCNA Bulletin listed the same source: NCNA. In both publications, the editors often did not acknowledge primary sources. For example, they quoted AP and UPI dispatches from Tokyo but referred only to "Tokyo sources." In some instances, however, foreign wire services and publications were specified as primary sources. Table 1a lists the source distribution of both *People's Daily* and the NCNA Bulletin. 97 per cent. and 93 per cent., respectively, of the space in *People's Daily* and the NCNA Bulletin came from Communist sources. NCNA supplied by far the largest share and in second place were other Communist sources. TASS was quoted twenty-three times in *People's Daily* and thirteen times in the NCNA Bulletin; several Soviet newspapers were also cited. Communist sources outside Communist China and the Soviet Union accounted for eleven items in *People's Daily* and thirty-five items in the NCNA Bulletin. No American wire services were specified and only five American newspapers were quoted in both publications.

A characteristic of NCNA dispatches was that they contained a far smaller proportion of first-hand news than one would find in other major wire services. Time and again, an NCNA dispatch merely transmitted without commentary a statement, an article or a radio broadcast.

The TKHH sample derived its materials from wire services, radio

⁸ Items not dealing with foreign news or foreign comments on events in Communist China are omitted.

^{8a} The NCNA home office's news output is sent to London via radioteletype where it is distributed in the form of daily bulletins from 76 Chancery Lane. The publisher's name is listed as "S. Chinque."

⁹ In this and all similar references, the Arabic numeral refers to the day in February 1960 and the Roman numeral to the page in TKHH.

TABLE 1a

Distribution of Primary Sources in People's Daily and NCNA Bulletin, by Nationality *

(in standard units *)

	Total	U.S.	U.K.	Communist China	India	France	Hong Kong	Western Germany	Nationalist China	Indonesia	Other non- Communist	Other Communist
units	2,367	36½	—	1,625½	—	—	—	—	—	—	48½	656½ (U.S.S.R.: 454½)
%	100	1.5	—	69	—	—	—	—	—	—	2	27.7
units	908½	12	—	641	—	—	—	5	—	1½	39½	209½ (U.S.S.R.: 68)
%	100	1.3	—	70	—	—	—	<1	—	<1	4.4	23

* Standard units are column inches computed as follows:

(a) for *People's Daily*: the length and width of each item, as it appeared in a microfilm reader, were first recorded. Then the length was determined on the basis of a standard width of 1 inch.

(b) for NCNA Bulletin: width of all items about 6½ inches.

transmissions and printed materials, with the first two slightly predominating (56.7 per cent.). The radio stations monitored and quoted in TKHH were all in Asia, with the exceptions of Radio Australia and BBC. They were All-India Radio, Radio Republik Indonesia, the U.S. Armed Forces Radio and Television Service,¹⁰ the "Japanese shortwave station"¹¹ and the Voice of Free China. The Voice of America is also monitored and cited in issues not included in this sample. Radio Peking was also quoted in TKHH but only indirectly, through AP and UPI in Tokyo.

Far more often quoted than radio stations were wire services, including, of course, TKHH's publisher, the NCNA. Because the TKHH's exclusive aim is to report on the world outside and on foreign reactions to Communist China, all news and features supplied to TKHH by NCNA originated abroad. Most NCNA wires came from New Delhi and Jakarta, reflecting both the relatively more important (for Communist China) news coming from those two offices at that time and the intrinsic significance of India and Indonesia for Peking, transcending events of the moment. But not a single item from the Moscow office appeared in the TKHH sample.

Sixty per cent. of wire service news was taken by four of the five services usually classified as "world services"¹²: Reuters, AP, UPI and Agence France-Presse (AFP). In the sample under study the difference of column inches between these four giant wire services was so small as to be insignificant.¹³ TASS, the fifth world service, was not quoted a single time. Regional wire services used by TKHH were Kyodo of Japan, the Press Trust of India (PTI), the Deutsche-Presse-Agentur ([West] German Press Agency—DPA), the Central News Agency (CNA) of Nationalist China and Antara of Indonesia.

With few exceptions they were used only for news from their own countries. The four world services were relied upon for news coverage for a much wider area. No regional specialisation could be detected. Quite often an event, not necessarily of major importance, was covered by items supplied by two or more world services (as well as by regional wire services).

The TKHH relied more on daily newspapers than other printed materials for both news and features. But weekly and occasionally

¹⁰ It is probable that several AFRTS stations in East and South-east Asia are monitored at any given time, depending on atmospheric conditions. The stations in Tokyo and Seoul are likely to be monitored more often than others because of location and wattage. On the other hand, it is doubtful that the very weak station in Taipei is monitored.

¹¹ It is not clear whether this designation referred to NHK or some other station.

¹² Davison, pp. 327-328.

¹³ The raw figures, based on a standard width of 1½ inches, were: Reuters 127 7/8 inches, UPI 110 3/8 inches, AP 110 inches and AFP 104½ inches.

monthly and quarterly publications were also used and balanced the daily Press in terms of space. In the sample no Australian or Latin American publications were quoted although secondary references were occasionally made, for example, to the "Latin American Press." There was surprisingly frequent use of the African Press, some on non-African events. European newspapers and journals quoted in TKHH came almost exclusively from the non-Communist areas. *Neues Deutschland* and *Pravda*, official organs of the central committees of the East German and Slovak Communist Parties, respectively, were the only East European sources. By contrast the TKHH sample of six issues contained quotations from some fourteen West European publications ranging geographically from *The Scotsman* of Edinburgh to *Die Welt* of Hamburg. Neither *Pravda* nor *Izvestiya* nor any other Soviet publication was quoted directly or indirectly.

North American publications quoted in the TKHH were with the exception of the *Canadian Tribune* all American. Not unexpectedly, almost twice as much space was taken up by the *New York Times* than by the *Christian Science Monitor*, the paper with the second highest figure of column inches in the TKHH sample.

Table 1b summarises the primary information sources for TKHH. The two most striking features were (1) the American predominance, well over twice as much as the nearest "competitor" and more than one-fourth of all space in the sample; and (2) the relatively puny share of all Communist sources, accounting for less than 17 per cent. It appears that TKHH coverage was indeed more objective than that of the *People's Daily* and the NCNA Bulletin.

Neither news nor features were taken from Communist newspapers and periodicals in the major countries specified in Table 1b, except Indonesia. In fact, besides the two Soviet-bloc newspapers mentioned earlier and *Harian Rakjat* of Indonesia, only four other Communist papers were quoted: *Al Akhbar* of Lebanon, *Ittihad Al Shaab* of Iraq, *Le Drapeau Rouge* of Belgium and *Ta Kung Pao* of Hong Kong (a branch of the mainland newspaper that ceased publication this summer and then reappeared as *Ch'ien-chin Pao (Forward)* in September). Moreover, of the newspapers and journals from non-Communist countries quoted in TKHH, very few could be labelled as pro-Communist. Perhaps the *Pakistan Times*, classified as pro-Leftist, came closest to this category and it was the only one of its kind in the TKHH sample.¹⁴ Most other papers were independent or conservative. In Pakistan's case, the *Pakistan Times* was "balanced off" by *Dawn*, a pro-Moslem

¹⁴ Classification by political orientation is according to Walter H. Mallory (ed.), *Political Handbook of the World 1961* (New York: Harper, 1961).

TABLE 1b
Distribution of Primary Sources in TKHH, by Nationality
 (in column inches)

	Total	U.S.	U.K.	Communist China	India	France	Hong Kong	Western Germany	Nationalist China	Indonesia	Other non- Communist	Other Communist
radio	747 $\frac{3}{8}$	222 $\frac{3}{8}$	129 $\frac{1}{4}$	142 $\frac{1}{4}$	44 $\frac{3}{8}$	104 $\frac{1}{4}$	—	9 $\frac{7}{8}$	30 $\frac{3}{8}$	25 $\frac{5}{8}$	39 $\frac{1}{2}$	—
paper	569 $\frac{1}{4}$	147 $\frac{3}{8}$	37 $\frac{3}{8}$	6 $\frac{1}{4}$	66 $\frac{1}{2}$	7 $\frac{3}{4}$	68 $\frac{1}{2}$	44 $\frac{3}{8}$	21	4	95 $\frac{3}{4}$	71 $\frac{7}{8}$ (U.S.S.R.: 0)
total	1,317 $\frac{3}{8}$	367 $\frac{3}{4}$	167 $\frac{3}{8}$	149	110 $\frac{3}{8}$	112	68 $\frac{1}{2}$	54 $\frac{1}{4}$	51 $\frac{3}{8}$	29 $\frac{3}{8}$	135 $\frac{1}{4}$	71 $\frac{7}{8}$ (U.S.S.R.: 0)
%	100	28.0	12.7	11.3	8.4	8.5	5.2	4.1	3.7	2.2	10.3	5.5

Note: In cases where a wire service merely reprints a publication (or portions thereof), the publication is listed as source.

League paper. *The Times* and *Daily Express* of London were two examples of conservative papers in TKHH.

GEOGRAPHICAL COVERAGE

By People's Daily and NCNA Bulletin

Table 2a provides an overview of how *People's Daily* and the NCNA Bulletin covered world events in February 1960. The six countries selected for special attention in this article accounted for about 58.2 per cent. and 67 per cent., respectively. Communist China and the Soviet Union dominated the field. Both the Chinese people and foreign audiences were regaled by seemingly endless panegyrics of Sino-Soviet friendship, undoubtedly particularly strong because of the tenth anniversary of the Sino-Soviet treaty on February 14. Large portions of the February 13 issues of *People's Daily* and NCNA Bulletins were devoted to this subject.

Aside from the six countries under study here, the *People's Daily* and the NCNA Bulletin provided their readers with rather restricted coverage, mostly of other Communist countries, Western Europe and Japan. Much space in *People's Daily* and the NCNA Bulletin was taken up by the activities of foreign Communist parties and Communist front organisations. When these two publications did mention some event outside Asia and Europe, usually that event itself was not covered. Instead, Communist-bloc commentaries were reprinted as, for example, on the occasion of the conclusion of the All-African People's Conference. Under the headline "The fighting African people will move from victory to victory," the *People's Daily* reproduced excerpts from newspapers in the Soviet Union, North Korea, North Vietnam, Mongolia, Hungary, Czechoslovakia and Rumania, all practically identical in content.

TKHH's geographical coverage was vastly different. As shown in Table 2b, the six countries under study took up as much as 81 per cent. of total space. Nationalist China had considerable lineage in TKHH but was completely ignored by publications for the Chinese people and foreign audiences. The nature and distribution of national stories and international stories in Table 2b suggest that two principal objectives of the TKHH were to inform the leaders about major current events and about the fundamental nature of some foreign countries. Current events were covered primarily by news items supplied by wire services. National images were formed predominantly through the use of feature articles taken from foreign publications. Taking the six countries itemised in Table 2b as a whole, it becomes apparent that TKHH was concerned more with news than with national images. Of the total

TABLE 2a

*Distribution of Subjects in People's Daily and NCNA Bulletin, by Country**

	U.S.	Communist China	India	Soviet Union	Indonesia	Nationalist China	Total	Others	Grand Total
unitst	339	555‡	40‡	984	24	—	1,943	1,427‡	3,370‡
%	17.5	28.6	2.1	50.7	1.2	—	100		
units	173	242‡	33	291	15‡	—	754‡	374‡	1,129‡
%	22.9	32	4.3	41	2.1	—	100		

* The designation of both Communist and Nationalist China as "countries" is solely for stylistic reasons. It does not imply acceptance of a "two-China concept."

† For computation of units, see explanatory note to Table 1a.

TABLE 2b

Distribution of Subjects in TKHH by Country

	U.S.	Communist China	India	Soviet Union	Indonesia	Nationalist China	Total	Others	Grand Total
CI	190 $\frac{5}{8}$	92 $\frac{1}{8}$	102 $\frac{3}{4}$	14 $\frac{1}{2}$	29 $\frac{3}{8}$	16 $\frac{5}{8}$	446		
PC	42.7	20.7	23.0	3.2	6.6	3.8	100.0		
CI	167 $\frac{1}{2}$	233	180 $\frac{1}{2}$	117 $\frac{3}{8}$	54 $\frac{3}{4}$	22 $\frac{3}{4}$	775 $\frac{5}{8}$		
PC	21.6	30.0	23.2	15.1	7.1	3.0	100.0		
CI	358 $\frac{1}{8}$	325 $\frac{1}{8}$	283	131 $\frac{7}{8}$	84 $\frac{1}{8}$	39 $\frac{3}{8}$	1,221 $\frac{5}{8}$	290 $\frac{1}{8}$	1,511 $\frac{3}{4}$
PC	29.3	26.6	23.2	10.8	6.9	3.2	100.00		

National

International

Total

CI = Column inches (1 $\frac{1}{2}$ inches width)

PC = Percentage

International items involved at least one foreign country. Because often a single news item involved two or more of the six listed countries, its lineage was recorded more than once. Hence, the total, 1,511 $\frac{3}{4}$ inches, is substantially larger than the actual total of 1,317 $\frac{3}{8}$ inches.

space devoted to these six countries, 775 $\frac{5}{8}$ inches or 63.5 per cent. concerned international news.

The proportions of international stories on India, Indonesia and Nationalist China were very close to this average, not deviating from it by more than 3.5 per cent. International items took 71 per cent. of the space on Communist China but because of the obviously special nature of national items on that country a comparison of the distribution of national and international items on Communist China with those of the other five countries would not be meaningful.

The two extreme deviations from the 63.5 per cent. average in Table 2b were most interesting. The Soviet Union, accounting for a mere 6.9 per cent. of total TKHH space, was mentioned almost exclusively (88 per cent.) in international items. These dealt almost wholly with the excursions of Messrs. Khrushchev, Voroshilov and Mikoyan. TKHH had almost nothing to say about life in the Soviet Union or Sino-Soviet relations. The paltry amount of space doled out to image-building feature articles, even smaller than that for tiny Formosa, was most peculiar in light of the official "unbreakable friendship" between the two countries.

The total absence of TASS or any other Soviet sources in the TKHH sample, plus the miniscule lineage of national items on the Soviet Union made the "message" to CCP officials quite clear. They were told by TKHH in February 1960 that the struggle against the Soviet Union for supremacy within the so-called socialist camp was on. As the first stage of this uphill fight, non-use of Soviet communications channels and studied indifference toward Soviet internal developments were to cut the Soviet Union "down to size" in the eyes of officials.

The United States was the only country with more national than international items. In fact, almost one-half of all space given to national news was taken by the United States. This severe imbalance in space allocation suggests that America was of top concern to the Chinese leadership. It simply would not do, as *vis-à-vis* the Soviet Union, studiously to ignore the United States. The United States was apparently so important that TKHH provided officials not only with a large amount of items about that country's foreign relations but also with the only extensive portrait of purely domestic aspects of any country.

Despite the heavy concentration on six countries which left only 19 per cent. for the rest of the world, the TKHH sample managed to publish items from all continents but Australia. Half a page in the February 4 issue was devoted to Africa, comprising nine items. A

long statement by President Nasser on Israel (5, II) led all Middle Eastern news which included items from Iraq, Syria and Israel.

Aside from a projected visit by President Eisenhower to Brazil and other Latin American countries and Mikoyan's trip to Cuba, TKHH published reports on a planned common free trade zone (21, IV), internal developments in El Salvador (21, III), Guatemala (21, IV) and the Dominican Republic (13, III), and an invitation by President Betancourt to foreign capital to invest in Venezuela (13, III). The longest item (13 $\frac{1}{4}$ inches) devoted to Latin America was taken from *U.S. News and World Report* and dealt with the "Turn Toward Socialism" (21, IV).

West European news in the TKHH sample included items on steel production and the British budget (5, III), French policies toward Algeria (6, III), plans in Germany to make a movie on Hitler (6, IV), an Asian film festival in Germany (10, IV), an article in *Revue de Défense Nationale* on Western strategy (13, III), a WHO report from Geneva, a comment on Scotland Yard and the selection of Miss Europe (all on 13, IV). There were also two articles on New Year's customs: in Asia (6, IV) and in Europe, America and Africa (10, IV), both reprinted from the *Chen Pao* of Hong Kong. Domestic news from Japan was confined to a Japanese comment on the Sino-Burmese treaty (6, I) and the completion of a five-language dictionary (10, IV).

COVERAGE OF EVENTS IN SELECTED COUNTRIES

Indonesia

Indonesian political-economic conditions were covered by seven items in the TKHH sample as compared to the NCNA, which restricted itself to the promotions of A. H. Nasution and F. S. Suryadarma, chiefs of staff of the army and the air force. Of the ten wire service reports used, only one was an NCNA dispatch which excerpted from an Indonesian newspaper, *Suluh Indonesia*. Five others came from Radio Republik Indonesia, Antara and Information Service Indonesia. The remainder was divided among AP (three times) and Reuters.

The promotions of Nasution and Suryadarma rated space in the TKHH on two different days (6, II, and 10, II). Although the Information Service Indonesia, the source for the February 10 item, quoted Sukarno as praising both generals, TKHH's headline made it appear as if only Nasution "has been meritorious toward country and people." Nasution was undoubtedly the more newsworthy of the two though hardly a hero with the Communists. TKHH had already singled him out on February 4 as the leader of a movement to combat Communist-led anti-government protests.

The other five items presented a picture of unrelieved economic gloom and political instability. The headlines of items published in the February 4 issue were indicative of this.

The TKHH also speculated about changes in the Indonesian "work cabinet," quoting *Suluh Indonesia*, and it reported that the Indonesian Army arrested "several persons," charging them with "causing discord" in army-Government relations.

Officials were informed about the tensions between Indonesia and Communist China over the Chinese residents problem several days before the people. Moreover, the coverage of events was considerably more complete. The first relevant item, on 4, I, reported that the Chinese Communist Ambassador conferred with an Indonesian Foreign Ministry official on the subject. The next day, TKHH reprinted three items supplied by Radio Republik Indonesia and Information Service Indonesia. The tone of these sources was factual but TKHH's headline denounced Subandrio, who conducted the talks with the Chinese Communists. On 6, I, TKHH pursued the attack on Subandrio. It questioned his sincerity by the use of quotation marks: "Subandrio proclaims at meeting Indonesia's 'tolerant and cautious' attitude toward us."

On February 13, when all mass media in mainland China and the NCNA Bulletin were preoccupied with the tenth anniversary of the Sino-Soviet treaty, TKHH's lead article on the front page gave officials the first full-scale denunciation of Indonesia. Using an NCNA dispatch, date-lined Jakarta, February 11, the 14½ inch article was headlined "Indonesia actually obstructs overseas Chinese from returning to motherland; Indonesian overseas Chinese preparing to return to motherland suffer great losses." The article contained a case-by-case description of "persecution" and declared: "toward this sort of unreasonable, inhumane treatment contravening international custom, the overseas Chinese compatriots are filled with deep anger."¹⁵

This bill of particulars was accompanied on the same page by two items, from NCNA and Antara, designed to "disclose Indonesia's insincerity." One item quoted Foreign Office Secretary General Suwito Kusumowidagdo (substituting for Dr. Subandrio) as saying that Indonesia would "help" (TKHH's quotes) Chinese residents to leave the country, while the other accused the Indonesian Press of "spreading rumours to prevents overseas Chinese from returning home."

India

Both *People's Daily* and NCNA Bulletin carried an identical NCNA

¹⁵ It is interesting to note that in the NCNA Bulletin's Index, arranged by regions, this item was not listed under South-east Asia but under China.

item, dated New Delhi, February 5, containing the official statement by the Indian Communists on the outcome of the Kerala state elections. It admitted that the Communists had "every reason to be disturbed" by the opposition's victory but found succour in the gain in popular votes. The NCNA Bulletin ran an additional item on these elections, under the same date-line. It was mostly a straight breakdown of the votes by seats, but it added that the election was held in an atmosphere of "anti-Communist hysteria." Neither publication said anything about the touchy subject of Sino-Indian relations.

TKHH told officials about the touchy subject of Sino-Indian relations, making it clear that the recently signed Sino-Burmese treaty and border agreement was directed more towards undercutting India's position than towards regularising relations with small Burma. In the six issues of the TKHH sample no less than seven items were devoted to that treaty. While *People's Daily* and the NCNA Bulletin treated it as an agreement wholly between Communist China and Burma, every relevant item in the TKHH headlined the treaty as a victory over India. As the *pièce de résistance* TKHH enlisted the *New York Times*, claiming that the paper "acknowledges that the Sino-Burmese border agreement already places India in a disadvantageous position."¹⁶

Besides these items on the Sino-Burmese treaty, TKHH published another eleven items more directly related to Sino-Indian relations. On the exchange of letters between Nehru and Chou En-lai, TKHH informed officials that India finally decided to publish the contents of one of Chou's letters and spent almost 7 inches to do so (4, I). To make its readers believe that world opinion sided with the Chinese, TKHH excerpted from an Iraqi paper, *Al Umma*, of December 30, 1959, on 6, I. The headline asserted that in the Iraqi paper's opinion "Premier Chou's letter proclaims the real facts about the border problem; all fair men believe that China did not 'invade' India." Nehru's reply drew three comments in the TKHH sample. TKHH also reprinted portions of Nehru's explanation to the Indian Parliament about his letter to Chou and some Indian commentaries on that letter.

Rather than reprinting the Indian Communists' explanation of the Kerala election results, as did *People's Daily* and the NCNA Bulletin, TKHH gave its readers extensive coverage based almost entirely on non-Communist sources. As soon as the first returns came in via the "Japanese shortwave station" and Radio Australia, TKHH (on 4, II) reported them. Five subsequent items, drawn from NCNA, Reuters, AFP, the *Times of India*, *Asahi*, PTI, the *New York Daily News* and

¹⁶ The original article can be found in the *New York Times*, February 1, p. 12, under the title "Burma Pact Held Setback to India."

the *New York Times*, claimed that in Western eyes, "the broad masses of Kerala support the Indian Communists" and that the Indian Government had "no reason to be happy" (quoting the *New York Times*). Finally, on 21, II, TKHH found satisfaction in the "defeat" of the three-party coalition against the Communists when it turned out that the Congress Party alone would organise the new state government.

Aside from keeping officials *au courant* on the Sino-Indian border dispute and the Kerala elections, TKHH spent considerable space on other developments in India completely ignored by *People's Daily* and the NCNA Bulletin. While those publications devoted entire pages to another tenth anniversary, TKHH excerpted a *New York Herald Tribune* editorial on the tenth anniversary of India's independence, quoting the paper as saying the first ten years had been "a praiseworthy milestone." This optimistic American appraisal was balanced by reports about Indian Government plans to enlarge the birth control campaign (4, II) and Nehru's alleged request that members of Congress do not discuss hunger deaths occurring in some parts of India (21, II).

A group of six items was devoted to foreign aid given and about to be given to India. Undoubtedly by accident rather than design, this group divided neatly into three reports on American aid (in quotation marks) and three on Soviet aid (without quotation marks). In terms of space allotted, the American items outweighed the Soviet items by two to one. The tone of the headlines differed somewhat between the two groups. TKHH conveyed the impression that Western aid was not given until India humiliated herself by asking for it. Soviet aid, on the other hand, was said to have been spontaneous. Perhaps too spontaneous to suit the Peking leadership. By headlining Soviet plans to help India set up an atomic power plant, TKHH may have intended to score the recent Soviet reneging on a similar agreement with Communist China.

Finally, the TKHH sample contained two items on India's relations with Pakistan and Nationalist China. On 13, II, a cartoon from *Shankar's Weekly* was reprinted showing an ample-bosomed Ayub Khan in low-cut blouse, skirt, high heels, and one leg high up in the air inviting a startled Nehru to dance. In the background was a uniformed band whose score sheets read SEATO. The two captions, in the original English, read "Let's Rock'n Roll" and "President Ayub Khan has again proposed an Indo-Pak defence pact." TKHH's headline indicated that the cartoon was to reveal "the truth about the 'joint defence' blared about by Ayub." But the short accompanying text, supplied by TKHH, was a straightforward explanation of the figures in the cartoon.

The second item reported that the Indian Government banned all materials printed by the Nationalists. According to Reuters, the ban was in response to Nationalist propaganda material intended to incite Tibetan refugees in India.

Nationalist China

Not a single news item in *People's Daily* made any mention of the island, declared by both governments to be a province of China. The NCNA Bulletin briefly reported that North Korea condemned the admission of "the Chiang Kai-shek organisation" into the International Astronomical Union.

Were it not for an occasional "Chiang clique" attached to such terms as "American imperialism," readers of the public publications would be unaware of Formosa's existence.

TKHH on the other hand devoted nine items to Nationalist China, six of which appeared on front pages. None mentioned Chiang Kai-shek's re-election. Instead, all but one item dealt with Formosa's relations with other countries, including a brief notice on 6, I, headlined "Chiang clique says: we shelled Quemoy on the 3rd." Other brief items involved India, three French scholarships (10, IV), two Japanese economic survey teams landing in Formosa (13, I) and "Chiang Chieh-shih" receiving the U.S. Pacific air force commander (10, I). All items were taken from the CNA without change in terminology. For example, the last item began with "President and Madame Chiang received . . ."

Quoting CNA and *L'Afrique Nouvelle* of Senegal, TKHH informed officials of the activities of a Nationalist trade delegation in West Africa on 10, I. An article in the *Hsiang-kang Shih-pao*, organ of the Kuomintang committee in Hong Kong, was quoted as saying that Nationalist China was dissatisfied with America's warm relations with India and Japan. A Nationalist comment on the Warsaw Treaty meeting in Moscow (see next section), as reported by AP, was reprinted in 10, I. According to the item, Kuomintang officials felt that the Chinese Communists did not participate in that meeting (except to send observers) for two reasons: (1) Moscow was pursuing its attempt to convince others that it wholeheartedly wished to preserve peace in Europe; and (2) Peking hoped to gain the freedom to create confusion in Asia. The TKHH headline, singling out the second reason, labelled it a "false accusation."

Finally, on 5, IV, New Year's celebrations in Formosa were reported, via CNA, AP and Reuters. This item was much longer than either of two other items on the same page dealing with celebrations

in other countries.¹⁷ The wire services commented on increasing prosperity in Formosa which was interpreted by TKHH, in its headline, as "doing their utmost to conceal loneliness of Formosa's dying days [*sui mu*]."

Soviet Union

TKHH gave a somewhat fuller account of Soviet visits to Asia than *People's Daily* and the NCNA Bulletin, and took its items entirely from the Press Trust of India and Western wire services. TKHH emphasised the prediction that the Soviet Union would increase economic aid while printing AP's prediction that "Khrushchev's visit will have big impact on Indian-Chinese border relations—but no one is willing to predict that he will solve the dispute."

Khrushchev's visit to Indonesia received little coverage, only 12½ inches in three items of which two were not on the visit itself. Only one item in the sample, on 21, II, carried three dispatches, two by UPI and one by Reuters, reporting on the Sukarno-Khrushchev conference in Bogor. According to the sub-headline, they discussed "the question of increasing aid to Indonesia."

TKHH said little about Soviet military strength which was discussed in a single report in *People's Daily* and the NCNA Bulletin. A 9⅞-inch item on 4, III, reprinted Kyodo and AP dispatches from Washington. Kyodo claimed, according to TKHH's headline, that "tremendous power of Soviet rockets causes United States foreign affairs and national defence officials to feel 'violently shaken up'." A UPI report on Eisenhower's admission of a Soviet lead in "outer-space" rockets was printed on 5, III. No mention was made of the Geneva talks which were also omitted from the public media.

While *People's Daily* and the NCNA Bulletin gave considerable space to the Warsaw Treaty meeting in Moscow, printing K'ang Sheng's speech in its entirety and the conference communiqué, TKHH merely reprinted Nationalist Chinese speculation about the meeting. The NCNA Bulletin published no less than thirty-five articles on Sino-Soviet friendship, whereas TKHH gave the Sino-Soviet treaty anniversary exactly 8½ inches on 13, I.

People's Daily spent enormous lineage on mutual congratulations and added feature articles glorifying the Soviet Union. Stories like "The friendship of two generations of people" and "Sino-Soviet co-operation promotes the flourishing of the two countries" were unabashed hosannas for the "elder brother."

¹⁷ The other two items reported New Year's celebrations in mainland China and the United States.

TKHH heaped scorn on AP's factual observation that the Sino-Soviet treaty was directed against Japan and anyone else formally associated with her.

TWO NATIONAL PROFILES

Image: The United States

The general tone of the coverage of American foreign policy in TKHH did not essentially differ from that of *People's Daily* and the NCNA Bulletin. Officials were given an image of the United States as a weakening, warmongering and exploiting nation. The chief differences lay in the manner of presentation and the nature of sources quoted. The TKHH sample contained no undated feature stories (as in *People's Daily*) nor nearly as many protest statements against the United States (as in the NCNA Bulletin). The general condition of the United States as a world Power was examined in the TKHH by quoting *Harian Rakjat*, official organ of the Indonesian Communist Party (6, II), according to which "American imperialism's sole aim is still the *status quo*," and Walter Lippmann, who felt that the United States had become a second-rate Power (4, III).¹⁸

More items were devoted to the image of a weakening United States. The eight items, reprinting reports by AP, UPI, Reuters, Kyodo, DPA and the *Washington Star*, developed this theme along three lines. First, U.S. foreign trade was in trouble. Quoting UPI, TKHH headlined on 21, IV, that "Last year's [1959] U.S. export rate to Latin America dropped." Second, the United States was being outdistanced in the armaments race. American officials allegedly were disturbed about Soviet ICBMs and Eisenhower acknowledged a widening gap in the field of "outer space rockets." Third, the U.S. position in Latin America was rapidly deteriorating. Quoting a *Washington Star* comment on Mikoyan's trip to Cuba, TKHH reported that "American officials are worried that Mikoyan's visit to Cuba will have a big impact" (6, III). In its descriptions of security arrangements in Brazil for Eisenhower's visit, TKHH tried to tell its readers that the President's safety was in great danger. It asserted, on 13, III, that Eisenhower was "nervous" (*t'i hsin tiao tan*) about his trip and, on 21, IV, that "American officials are afraid that Eisenhower will get into trouble in Latin America."

According to TKHH, the United States was also exploiting West Africa by trying to replace France as colonial master. Another form of exploitation, in TKHH's opinion, was economic aid. The editors

¹⁸ For a translation of the full headline on Lippmann's article, see p. 71. His article was briefly cited for the Chinese people by *People's Daily* the following day.

always adorned the word "aid" with quotation marks but, unlike *People's Daily* and the NCNA Bulletin, they refrained from making the charge of exploitation explicit. TKHH reported that Nyerere (4, IV) and India (6, II) asked for American aid. It also published UPI reports that Senator Kennedy during his Presidential campaign through Indiana and Kentucky urged increased aid to India in order to combat Communism (13, II) and reprinted, with only three insignificant omissions, a *New York Times* editorial of February 7 welcoming such aid (10, III).

The theme of American "warmongering" was fully exploited in the TKHH sample. Items on Eisenhower's plan to speed the satellite programme and on joint U.S.-West German military manoeuvres, presented on 4, III, were mildest. Another TKHH item quoted three wire services as saying that Senators Humphrey and Magnuson and others were "beating the drums" for an increase in military strength, and yet another item excerpted from a USIA release concerning Eisenhower's call to defend "freedom" (TKHH's quotes) around the world (both on 10, III).

As proof positive of United States aggression, TKHH produced in an item on 21, III dispatches by AP and Reuters reporting that an American plane dropped some bombs on Cuba. The headline dismissed prompt American apologies with "Rock-hard evidence; no chance for repudiation; U.S. State Department is forced to admit the criminal air attack on Cuba."

TKHH also published some UPI and USIA reports on the American position on the atomic test ban proposal, which TKHH called "another way of Eisenhower's playing with peace" (13, III). American consideration of a possible legislative amendment to permit allies to obtain U.S. atomic weapons was described on 6, III, and 10, III, as "encouraging war preparations." Foreign reactions, according to TKHH, were mixed. The *Canadian Tribune* was against accepting U.S. atomic weapons (4, III) but the French and Canadian governments welcomed them (6, III).

Aside from an item on American reactions to the Sino-Indian border dispute, TKHH published three other items on U.S. attitudes toward Communist China. On 4, III, TKHH declared that the *Atlantic Monthly*, in its February 1960 issue, admitted that American China policy was in a rut. Kyodo, AP and DPA were cited to report that "the United States thinks that our participation in a disarmament agreement is not a good idea" (10, I). Finally, former Assistant Secretary of State for Far Eastern Affairs Walter S. Robertson came under fire on 10, III, for his "insane [*feng k'uang*] attacks on our country." The

indictment was based on Robertson's speech in Williamsburg, Virginia, on February 8 in which he stated that "in nine years, the Peking régime fostered external and internal wars six times [*sic!*]—Korea, Tibet, India, China, Philippines, Malaya and Laos."

With regard to domestic events in the United States, TKHH differed sharply from *People's Daily* and the NCNA Bulletin in both quantity and quality of items. It carried ten items compared with nine in the NCNA Bulletin and only one in *People's Daily*. Furthermore, TKHH gave officials a much wider view of life in the United States. Four items were clearly propagandistic. TKHH printed excerpts from the Hong Kong edition of *Ta Kung Pao* to report a strike of Hollywood actors (10, IV). Quoting from an AP interview with some song writers working for advertising firms in New York, TKHH condemned them as "mercenary tools of the capitalists." A report on the rising incidence of mental diseases from the Hong Kong *Kung Shang Pao* was published on 6, IV. Finally, a UPI dispatch from Washington on the House Un-American Activities Committee was reprinted on 10, IV. TKHH commented that a report of the committee quoted in the article "beat the drums" against the Soviet and Chinese Communists, and sought to create a cold war atmosphere.

While these four items differed but slightly in tone from those in *People's Daily* and the NCNA Bulletin, other items in TKHH dealing with domestic American events were wholly different. Officials were informed about how overseas Chinese in the United States celebrated the lunar New Year (5, IV) and of their influential role in Hawaii (6, IV). TKHH also made room for a short AP report from the University of California Press that it was going to publish a Mongolian-English dictionary (10, IV) and for a feature article simply entitled "New York Police Academy" excerpted from the January 26 issue of *Chen Pao* of Hong Kong. The article related the school's historical background and gave a factual account of its curriculum. Finally, TKHH spent no less than 40 inches on the best-selling books of 1959 by excerpting an article from *Lien Ho Pao* (Taipei) (13, IV) and reprinting another from *Time Magazine* (6, IV).

Self-image: Communist China

People's Daily and the NCNA Bulletin occasionally gave their readers foreign comments on Chinese Communist foreign relations, but they presented no foreign comments on conditions inside Communist China. By contrast, TKHH published eight items including an AFP dispatch describing New Year's celebrations in Peking, a broadcast by Radio Peking, quoted by UPI Tokyo, dealing with the reception

and settlement of Chinese "returning from overseas," that is, mostly from Indonesia, and a long article from the Moroccan *Al Alam* recounting its general editor's impressions of his visit to mainland China.

The remaining five items focused on whether the Chinese Communist economy was still "leaping." As *People's Daily* in its January 1 editorial had already intimated, "some people" in mainland China felt that the Great Leap Forward had petered out. A five-paragraph AFP commentary of which four were quotations from *Red Flag* claiming that the economy was growing by leaps and bounds was published on 5, I. TKHH condemned AFP for adding a last paragraph of comments by foreign observers who predicted that the back-yard steel programme probably would not be repeated.

The other four items, all appearing on 5, IV, were neatly divided into two friendly and two hostile assessments of the Chinese economy. An NCNA dispatch from Prague paraphrased an assertion by *Pravda*, organ of the Slovak Communist Party committee, that "China develops several times faster than India." The same item declared that North Korea "is in the process of surpassing the Japanese production level." The second friendly item was composed of excerpts from an article by the Peking correspondent of *Neues Deutschland* (East Berlin), based on figures supplied by the Chinese Communists and stating that the Second Five-Year Plan was completed three years ahead of schedule. No mention was made of the communes.

The hostile exhibits were excerpts from *Newsweek* in which the magazine "slanders by saying that we have 'ruthlessly mobilised entire labour power'" and a CNA English dispatch from New York quoting a few passages from an article by a French economist. TKHH picked one sentence for its charge that the French economist "falsely accuses us that the Great Leap Forward 'retards' man."

SOME SPECIFIC EDITORIAL PRACTICES

This article has described TKHH's practice of lumping together items on specific subjects: Africa, the United States, the issue of economic progress in Communist China, and Sino-Indonesian relations, to mention but a few. Many foreign newspapers follow the same practice, but TKHH differs in that it is willing to delay certain items, at times for weeks on end, if they do not fit into a particular "message" to be conveyed to officials.

Other practices of the TKHH were:

(1) Small insignificant omissions possibly copied from the source. One sentence and two clauses were omitted from a *New York Times*

editorial of February 7 transmitted by AP on the same day. Because they were not essential to the editorial theme, the cutting may have occurred before TKHH received the item, in either the AP World Service or the AP Asian Service.

(2) Omissions due to space shortage: TKHH printed only the first three paragraphs of a four-paragraph *Newsweek* article on the Chinese economy. The first three contained all the negative comments in the article; the omitted paragraph stated that soldiers and policemen pitched in and helped build roads, dams and irrigation ditches. As in the first case, the probable reason for the omission was technical rather than political.

(3) Omissions due to translation problems: The TKHH item on best-selling fiction reprinted from *Time* was accurate, but the last sentence of the entry for Joyce Cary's *Captive and the Free* was omitted. *Time* asked: "Does the mystical hipster sometimes feel more truly than the Establishment square?" Chances are that this bit of Timesese was omitted because it would have taken too much space to transform into intelligible Chinese.

(4) Omission due to possible editorial misjudgment:

TKHH omitted one novel, Vladimir Nabokov's *Real Life of Sebastian Knight*, from *Time*'s list of fourteen best sellers. Because this novel was not the last item in *Time*'s list, its omission was probably not due to space reasons. My guess is that TKHH mistook either the author, the novel or both for a "political problem." Thus, rather than risk complications with higher authorities, the editors simply omitted the entry.

(5) Selective headlines: A dispatch by Information Service Indonesia announcing the promotion of Generals Nasution and Suryadarma stated that "these two military officials who were promoted on the basis of merit attained toward country and people . . ." TKHH's headline, however, mentioned only Nasution.

(6) Headlines wholly at variance with text: Three dispatches by CNA, AP and Reuters described peace and prosperity in Formosa, and CNA contrasted Formosa with conditions on the mainland. TKHH's headline, however, talked of the "loneliness of Formosa's dying days."

(7) Omissions for clearly political reasons: On 5, III, TKHH claimed to have reprinted a complete article by Joseph C. Harsch from the January 27 issue of the *Christian Science Monitor*, but it omitted one paragraph—located towards the middle of the article:

The United States today disposes of enormous military power and the range of its influence is wide and impressive. Thus, the best justification for the new look at military policy is that it's now in its eighth year and the Soviet Union has not taken advantage of the relative

decline in American military strength. Both Moscow and Peking have been careful to avoid a fatal test of Washington's willingness and capacity to defend the West.

TKHH undoubtedly omitted this paragraph because neither America's great influence nor Chinese reluctance to test this influence could be admitted either to the censors themselves, or to Chinese officials, or to both.

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

Compared to the Chinese people, officials received substantially different information about the outside world based on a vastly greater number of sources. 83 per cent. of the information given to officials came from non-Communist sources, whereas about 97 per cent. of information given to the people came from Communist sources. In further contrast to the people, officials also read some non-political news items such as the selection of Miss Europe and the publication of dictionaries. In some of the cases where substantially the same information was given to officials and the people, the officials received it first.

TKHH and the mass media also had vastly different geographical coverage. The people were given more news space about the Soviet Union, other Communist countries and Communist parties than about the rest of the world. Officials received only a tiny fraction of news about their foreign associates. The people were kept completely in the dark about the Nationalist government and conditions in Formosa. Officials were kept abreast of some events involving their compatriots across the Straits. The people were not informed about what people in other countries thought about events in Communist China. Officials were given some foreign comment. They were also much more extensively informed about internal events in such countries as India, Indonesia and the United States. Perhaps most noteworthy of all, the strait-jacket of a black-and-white image of the world, forced upon the people, was slightly loosened for officials. In some cases officials were given a clearer view of their country's foreign policy objectives.

In February 1960, nothing was said to the people about the actual state of Sino-Soviet relations, but officials were informed in two ways: through direct references, via Nationalist Chinese and American sources, to "difficulties" and "differences," and through the total boycott of Soviet sources, the studied indifferences toward internal events in the Soviet Union and the extremely small linage on the Sino-Soviet treaty anniversary.

The news flow to officials may be broader and more substantial than the information given to the people but it is subject to rigorous

restrictions. Some types of news do not get through to the officials at all, others do but only after some delay, and of these, many are edited for political as well as technical reasons, before they are passed on to the officials.

In sum, although the composite image of the world emerging from the pages of TKHH is more detailed than that inculcated into the Chinese people it is nonetheless seriously distorted. Moreover, the most severe distortions occur in the same places and for the same reasons as those in the image presented to the people. Both TKHH and *People's Daily* tacitly acknowledge American tactical strength. But they refuse to let through to their readers anything showing that America's military power, so visible abroad, springs from a most formidable fundamental strength at home. This severe distortion of reality is due to the ideological tenet that all "capitalist" countries are decaying internally. Thus, news items which contradict this article of Marxist faith are either edited or simply suppressed.

Because TKHH's circulation does not reach into the highest echelons of leadership, the crucial question remains: how accurately do the seven men in the standing committee of the central committee's political bureau, pinnacle of power in Communist China, perceive the outside world and particularly that other great Pacific nation, the United States? In all probability, they have complete access to the vast amount of information constantly flowing into Communist China, and when *their* "reference news" bulletins become available, I am certain that this guess will be confirmed. But this study gives no encouragement to the assumption that more information necessarily results in more realistic images. We are left with no more than a hope that somehow the distortions specified here are banished from the minds of the seven men.

APPENDIX

February 4, 1960

Page 1:

[Foreign Relations of China, Communist and Nationalist]

[Lead Item]

Ambassador Huang Chen and Suwito Convene Meeting

DISCUSS IMPLEMENTATION OF DUAL CITIZENSHIP TREATY
AND DETAILS OF THE PROBLEM OF REMOVING CHINESE
RESIDENTS

[AFP, Jakarta, February 2; 5½ inches]

**AFP Acknowledges that the Sino-Burmese Treaty and Agreement
ARE GREAT ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF OUR COUNTRY'S FOREIGN
POLICY**

[AFP, Peking, February 1; 5 $\frac{1}{8}$ inches]

The English *Manchester Guardian* Says

THE SINO-BURMESE BORDER AGREEMENT DISTRESSES INDIA
[*Manchester Guardian*, February 1; 4 $\frac{3}{8}$ inches]

New Delhi Papers Report

**INDIA AT LAST DECIDES TO PUBLISH CONTENTS OF OUR
COUNTRY'S LETTER**

[NCNA, New Delhi, February 2; 6 $\frac{7}{8}$ inches]

Most Burmese Papers Say Sino-Burmese Agreement

**IS TESTIMONY TO CHINA'S SINCERE DESIRE TO SOLVE
BORDER ISSUES**

[AFP, Rangoon, February 2; 4 $\frac{5}{8}$ inches]

**American Officials Falsely Predict Prospects of Sino-Indian Border Problem
TO CAUSE DISCORD, THEY SAY WE INCREASE PRESSURE ON
NEHRU TO FORCE HIM TO CONFER WITH US**

[UPI, Washington, February 2; *Christian Science Monitor*,
January 29; 11 inches]

New Delhi Politicians Are Affected by Sino-Burmese Agreement

**INDIAN PAPERS NOTE THAT AGREEMENT DID NOT MENTION
"McMAHON LINE"**

[NCNA, New Delhi, February 2; 7 $\frac{3}{4}$ inches]

Several Indian Papers Initiate Slander and Contention

**FOOLISH SCHEME TO DENIGRATE TREMENDOUS IMPACT OF
SINO-BURMESE TREATY OF FRIENDSHIP AND BORDER
AGREEMENT**

[NCNA, New Delhi, February 2; 7 $\frac{3}{8}$ inches]

Page 2:

[Other Asian Countries]

[Lead Item]

Armed Clash and Air Fight on Syrian-Israeli Border

**UAR INFORMS ARMISTICE COMMISSION ACCUSING ISRAEL
OF STARTING INTRUSION**

AP Says Troops of Both Sides Are in High State of Agitation

[NCNA, Damascus, February 1; AFP, Damascus, February 1;
AP, Damascus, February 1; AFP, Jerusalem, February 1; Reuters,
Cairo, February 2; UPI, Jerusalem (Israeli sector), February 2;
11 $\frac{1}{2}$ inches]

Indonesia Positively Prepares to Welcome Khrushchev

[AP, Jakarta, February 2; 3 inches]

AP Says Indonesian Political Situation Could Change Drastically

SAYS DECREE TO SIMPLIFY POLITICAL PARTIES WILL SUBJECT
LEFT AND RIGHT FACTIONS TO EVEN GREATER
DIFFICULTIES

[AP, Jakarta, January 25; 8 $\frac{1}{8}$ inches]

Sukarno Speaks on Question of Domestic Economic Difficulties

NASUTION ORDERS MOVE TO CURB MASSES PROTESTING
RISE IN COMMODITY PRICES

[Antara, Jakarta, January 28; Radio Republik Indonesia,
February 2; 3 $\frac{1}{8}$ inches]

Iraqi Ittihad Al Shaab Celebrates Its First Anniversary

[NCNA, Baghdad, January 26; 2 inches]

FIRST RETURNS FROM KERALA STATE ELECTIONS PUBLISHED

Namboodiripad and Others Reelected

[Japanese Shortwave Station, February 3; Radio Australia,
February 3; 5 inches]

Nahdatul Ulama Chairman Attacks Sukarno

[AP, Jakarta, January 28; 3 $\frac{1}{4}$ inches]

New York Herald Tribune **Comments on India's Tenth Anniversary**

PROPAGANDISES THESE TEN YEARS AS "A PRAISEWORTHY
MILESTONE"

[Reuters, New York, January 30; 7 $\frac{1}{4}$ inches]

Soviet Union Will Help India Set up Atomic Power Station

[Reuters, New Delhi, January 30; 2 inches]

Reuters Reports

INDIAN GOVERNMENT PLAN TO ENLARGE BIRTH CONTROL
CAMPAIGN

[Reuters, New Delhi, January 9; 7 $\frac{1}{8}$ inches]

Page 3:

[News from the United States and Europe]

[Lead Item]

Lippmann Laments

AMERICA HAS ALREADY BECOME A DECADENT SECOND-RATE
NATION

**Acknowledges That in Missiles and Space America Has No Chance Ever to
Surpass Soviet Union**

[NCNA, Geneva, January 30; 15 $\frac{1}{4}$ inches]

An American Magazine Admits U.S. China Policy Has Sunk into Difficulties
 SCHEMES TO EXACERBATE DIFFERENCES IN SINO-SOVIET
 RELATIONS IN ORDER TO POSITIVELY CREATE TWO
 CHINAS

[CNA, New York, January 30; 9½ inches]

Kyodo Says Tremendous Power of Soviet Rockets

CAUSES U.S. FOREIGN AFFAIRS AND NATIONAL DEFENCE
 OFFICIALS FEEL "SHAKEN UP VIOLENTLY"

[Kyodo, Tokyo, February 2; AP, Washington, January 30; 9¾ inches]

To Speed up "Earth Satellite Plan"

EISENHOWER INCREASES SPACE PLAN FUNDS

[AFP, Denver, Colorado, February 1; 3¼ inches]

Lloyd Publicly Threatens to Postpone Independence

DECLARES ENGLAND WILL RETAIN TYRANNICAL MILITARY
 BASES ON CYPRUS

[AP, London, February 1; Reuters, London, February 1; 8½ inches]

American and West German Armies

CONDUCT LARGE-SCALE MILITARY EXERCISES

[U.S. Armed Forces Radio Station, Los Angeles, February 1;
New York Times special cable, Vilseck, West Germany, January
 31; 5½ inches]

Mikoyan Arrives in Cuba Today

[UPI, Havana, January 31, 1½ inches]

CANADIAN TRIBUNE REPRIMANDS GOVERNMENT FOR
 ACCEPTING U.S. ATOMIC WEAPONS

Seeks to Bring about Neutralist Policy to Protect National Interest

[*Canadian Tribune*, January 25; 8½ inches]

Page 4:

[Feature Articles]

[Lead Item]

Belgian Communist *Le Drapeau Rouge* Says 1960 is Africa Year

AFRICA TO MOVE WITH GIANT STEPS TOWARD COMPLETE
 INDEPENDENCE

[*Le Drapeau Rouge*, December 31, 1959; 5 inches]

FRANCE, U.S. SHARPEN CONTEST FOR CONTROL OVER NORTH
 AND WEST AFRICA

[*Ar Rai Al Am* of Morocco, January 6. 6¾ inches]

England Becomes Increasingly Uneasy over Japanese Activities in Africa

[*Handelsblatt* of West Germany, December 17, 1959; 3½ inches]

The Observer of England Admits

ERA OF WESTERN COLONIALISM IN AFRICA HAS ALREADY ENDED

[*The Observer*, January 3; 7 $\frac{1}{2}$ inches]

Algerian El Moudjahid Reports

ANGOLAN PEOPLE INTENSIFY STRUGGLE AGAINST COLONIALISM

[*El Moudjahid*, January 5; 10 $\frac{1}{8}$ inches]

Neues Deutschland Exposes Rise of West Germany's Evil Ambitions

BONN TRAINS SPECIAL FORCE FOR OPERATIONS IN AFRICA

[*Neues Deutschland*, December 29, 1959; 5 $\frac{1}{8}$ inches]

Propagate West German Plans for Migration to South Africa

[DPA, Pretoria, February 2; 1 $\frac{1}{2}$ inches]

Second Session of African Nations' Conference to Convene in June

[AP, United Nations, January 22; 4 $\frac{1}{4}$ inches]

President of Ugandan National Assembly Says

EAST AFRICA RAISED GREAT FORCE OF NATIONALISM

[PTI, Trivandrum, January 19; 12 inches]

Nyerere Seeks "Aid" from America

[AP, Dar es Salaam, January 29; AP, Washington, February 1; 2 $\frac{1}{2}$ inches]

INTERNATIONAL SHORTWAVE [Short items; not included in analysis]

Felt Active in Far East [AP, Honolulu, February 1]

Sukarno Goes to Bali for Rest [Radio Republik Indonesia, February 1]

Iraq Ends Trial of Assassination Plotters [AFP Baghdad, January 31]

French Authorities Unreasonably Suppress *Libération* [AP, Paris, February 1]

India Has One Million TB Cases [PTI, New Delhi, January 17]